

## Exhibit 5 - Segovia Duplicative Time

Date Billed On	Billed By	Description: Redacted	Rate	Time Claimed	Value Claimed	Category	Entry #	Objection	Abandoned or Unsuccessful	Reduced Hours for Abandoned & Unsuccessful	Reasonable Hours
10/23/2018	Sean Short	Editing and revision of Second Amended Complaint, Motion for leave to file Second Amended Complaint, amended scheduling order and Proposed Order	\$255.00	0.5	\$127.50	Complaint/Summons/Service	485	Duplicative of 461 and 484		0.50	0.00
10/23/2018	Sean Short	Editing and revision of Second Amended Complaint	\$255.00	0.5	\$127.50	Complaint/Summons/Service	484	Duplicative of 461		0.50	0.00
10/23/2018	Josh Sanford	Examination of revised Second Amended Complaint	\$500.00	0.25	\$125.00	Complaint/Summons/Service	493	Duplicative of 461		0.25	0.00
10/23/2018	Josh Sanford	Editing and revision of Motion, two order, Second Amended Complaint	\$500.00	0.6	\$300.00	Complaint/Summons/Service	495	Duplicative of 461, 488, 485		0.60	0.00
11/12/2018	Vanessa Kinney	Editing and revision of Certification Motion	\$360.00	0.6	\$216.00	Conditional Certification	552	Duplicative of 550		0.60	0.00
11/13/2018	Sean Short	Editing and revision of Declaration for renewed Motion for collective action	\$255.00	0.1	\$25.50	Conditional Certification	565	Duplicative of 564		0.10	0.00
11/13/2018	Josh Sanford	Editing and revision of Declaration	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Conditional Certification	572	Duplicative of 564		0.10	0.00
11/15/2018	Sean Short	Editing and revision of renewed Motion for collective action and renewed Motion for notice	\$255.00	0.8	\$204.00	Conditional Certification	587	Duplicative of 590		0.80	0.00
11/15/2018	Sean Short	Editing and revision of renewed Motion for collective action and renewed Motion for notice	\$255.00	0.5	\$127.50	Conditional Certification	588	Duplicative of 590		0.50	0.00
12/3/2018	Josh Sanford	Examination of text order	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Case Management	632	Duplicative of 638		0.10	0.00
12/10/2018	Vanessa Kinney	Receipt and review of Summary Judgment Motion	\$360.00	0.6	\$216.00	First Summary Judgment	652	Duplicative of 649		0.60	0.00
3/29/2019	Josh Sanford	Examination of email to Opposing Counsel	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Opposing Counsel Communicat	775	Duplicative of 773		0.10	0.00
4/4/2019	Merideth Q. McEnti	Preparation for Hearing in by reviewing recent pleadings	\$360.00	0.5	\$180.00	Conditional Certification	801	Duplicative of 796		0.50	0.00
4/5/2019	Josh Sanford	Examination of order	\$500.00	0.2	\$100.00	Conditional Certification	810	Duplicative of 805		0.20	0.00
4/5/2019	Merideth Q. McEnti	Editing and revision of Consent and Notice provided by opposing counsel with Judge Bermorad's corrections included	\$360.00	0.5	\$180.00	Collective Management	818	Duplicative of 737		0.50	0.00
4/8/2019	Josh Sanford	Examination of revised notice from Court	\$500.00	0.2	\$100.00	Conditional Certification	821	Duplicative of 809		0.20	0.00
4/11/2019	Josh Sanford	Examination of email to Opposing Counsel regarding C. Collins	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Opposing Counsel Communicat	844	Duplicative of 843		0.10	0.00
4/15/2019	Sean Short	Receipt and review of edits to notice and consent	\$255.00	0.2	\$51.00	Collective Management	852	Duplicative of 737, 818		0.20	0.00
4/17/2019	Sean Short	Work on Client's file regarding Notice and Consent forms for class mailing.	\$255.00	0.2	\$51.00	Collective Management	857	Duplicative of 737, 818, 852 Vauge		0.20	0.00
4/18/2019	Josh Sanford	Editing and revision of consent form	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Collective Management	862	Duplicative of 737, 818, 852, 857		0.10	0.00
4/30/2019	Sean Short	Preparation and drafting of consent to join.	\$255.00	0.2	\$51.00	Collective Management	905	Duplicative of 737, 818, 852, 857		0.20	0.00
4/30/2019	Sean Short	Preparation and drafting of Consents to Join.	\$255.00	0.3	\$76.50	Collective Management	906	Duplicative of 905		0.30	0.00
5/1/2019	Sean Short	Preparation and drafting of consents to join.	\$255.00	0.3	\$76.50	Collective Management	947	Duplicative of 737, 818, 852, 857, 905		0.30	0.00
5/2/2019	Sean Short	Preparation and drafting of consent to join.	\$255.00	0.1	\$25.50	Collective Management	959	Duplicative of 737, 818, 852, 857, 905, 947		0.10	0.00
5/3/2019	Sean Short	Preparation and drafting of consent to join.	\$255.00	0.1	\$25.50	Collective Management	971	Duplicative of 737, 818, 852, 857, 905, 947, 959		0.10	0.00
5/7/2019	Sean Short	Receipt and review of signed consent to join; prepare for filing.	\$255.00	0.1	\$25.50	Collective Management	1000	Duplicative of 971		0.10	0.00
5/13/2019	Sean Short	Receipt and review of signed consents to join; prepare for filing.	\$255.00	0.1	\$25.50	Collective Management	1010	Duplicative of 1000		0.10	0.00
5/31/2019	Sean Short	Editing and revision of Plaintiff's first set of ROGs and RFPs.	\$255.00	0.2	\$51.00	Discovery Related	1101	Duplicative of 1081, 1085		0.20	0.00
5/31/2019	Sean Short	Editing and revision of Plaintiffs' Second Set of Discovery.	\$255.00	0.2	\$51.00	Discovery Related	1103	Duplicative of 1081, 1085		0.20	0.00

## Exhibit 5 - Segovia Duplicative Time

Date Billed On	Billed By	Description: Redacted	Rate	Time Claimed	Value Claimed	Category	Entry #	Objection	Abandoned or Unsuccessful	Reduced Hours for Abandoned & Unsuccessful	Reasonable Hours
6/4/2019	Vanessa Kinney	Editing and revision of Good faith discovery Letter and email to Sean Short	\$360.00	0.2	\$72.00	Discovery Related	1112	Duplicative of 1102		0.20	0.00
6/5/2019	Sean Short	Preparation and drafting of consent to join.	\$255.00	0.1	\$25.50	Collective Management	1117	Duplicative of 1010		0.10	0.00
6/5/2019	Sean Short	Editing and revision of good faith letter.	\$255.00	0.3	\$76.50	Discovery Related	1120	Duplicative of 1102, 1112		0.30	0.00
6/7/2019	Sean Short	Editing and revision of good faith letter.	\$255.00	0.5	\$127.50	Discovery Related	1142	Duplicative of 1102, 1112, 1120		0.50	0.00
6/19/2019	Josh Sanford	Receive, read and prepare response to email(s) from OC: form/contact of notice	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Opposing Counsel Communicat	1184	Duplicative of 1189		0.10	0.00
6/20/2019	Sean Short	Editing and revision of proposed order for second class notice.	\$255.00	0.2	\$51.00	Collective Management	1187	Duplicative of 1188		0.20	0.00
6/21/2019	Sean Short	Editing and revision of proposed order regarding notice.	\$255.00	0.2	\$51.00	Collective Management	1201	Duplicative of 1188		0.20	0.00
6/24/2019	Josh Sanford	Examination of order	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Collective Management	1209	Duplicative of 1215		0.10	0.00
7/1/2019	Josh Sanford	Receive, read and prepare response to email(s) from chambers and OC: phone conference	\$500.00	0.2	\$100.00	Court Communication	1232	Duplicative of 1229		0.20	0.00
7/3/2019	Merideth Q. McEnti	Telephone Conference(s) with Judge Bemporad, JS, SS, and OC Craig Stokely regarding proof of undeliverable mail	\$360.00	0.3	\$108.00	Court Communication	1253	Duplicative of 1251		0.30	0.00
8/16/2019	Josh Sanford	Preparation for Hearing with MQ and SS	\$500.00	0.3	\$150.00	Case Management	1391	Duplicative of 1400		0.30	0.00
8/20/2019	Josh Sanford	Examination of scheduling order	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Case Management	1405	Duplicative of 1408		0.10	0.00
8/22/2019	Josh Sanford	Examination of order reassigning case	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Case Management	1411	Duplicative of 1413		0.10	0.00
10/18/2019	Josh Sanford	Examination of discovery answers	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Discovery Related	1435	Duplicative of 1436		0.10	0.00
2/19/2020	Josh Sanford	Work on Client's file: case strategy, after rev of file	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Case Management	1486	Duplicative of 1411, 1413		0.10	0.00
4/22/2020	Josh Sanford	Examination of OC email	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Opposing Counsel Communicat	1771	Duplicative of 1768		0.10	0.00
5/22/2020	Josh Sanford	Examination of OC email	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Opposing Counsel Communicat	1910	Duplicative of 1898		0.10	0.00
5/26/2020	Josh Sanford	Examination of email to OC, with discovery answers	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Opposing Counsel Communicat	1918	Duplicative of 1925		0.10	0.00
5/29/2020	Josh Sanford	Examination of OC email	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Opposing Counsel Communicat	1939	Duplicative of 1936		0.10	0.00
6/1/2020	Josh Sanford	Examination of OC email re; depos, stipulation	\$500.00	0.2	\$100.00	Opposing Counsel Communicat	1945	Duplicative of 1940		0.20	0.00
6/4/2020	Josh Sanford	Examination of email to OCs-depos	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Opposing Counsel Communicat	1970	Duplicative of 1940		0.10	0.00
6/10/2020	Merideth Q. McEnti	Receipt and review of Deposition notices and links for attending remote depositions	\$360.00	0.1	\$36.00	Deposition Related	1991	Duplicative of 1977	90% Unsuccessful on depo substance, per summary judgment ruling Doc. 158.	0.01	0.00
6/14/2020	Josh Sanford	Deposition of (travel to Dallas)	\$500.00	5.2	\$2,600.00	Deposition Related	2001	Duplicative of 2009; Travel time	90% Unsuccessful on depo substance, per summary judgment ruling Doc. 158.	0.52	0.00
6/16/2020	Josh Sanford	Deposition of D. Dixon, with prep and local travel	\$500.00	4.4	\$2,200.00	Deposition Related	2015	Duplicative of 2020	90% Unsuccessful on depo substance, per summary judgment ruling Doc. 158.	0.44	0.00
6/17/2020	Josh Sanford	Deposition of Luna, with local travel	\$500.00	4.2	\$2,100.00	Deposition Related	2025	Duplicative of 2026	90% Unsuccessful on depo substance, per summary judgment ruling Doc. 158.	0.42	0.00
6/18/2020	Josh Sanford	Examination of 7 NODs	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Deposition Related	2037	Duplicative of 2038	90% Unsuccessful on depo substance, per summary judgment ruling Doc. 158.	0.01	0.00
6/19/2020	Josh Sanford	Examination of emails with OC	\$500.00	0.2	\$100.00	Opposing Counsel Communicat	2047	Duplicative of 2035		0.20	0.00
6/22/2020	Josh Sanford	Deposition of (travel to Corpus Christi)	\$500.00	8.5	\$4,250.00	Deposition Related	2062	Duplicative of 2067; Travel time	90% Unsuccessful on depo substance, per summary judgment ruling Doc. 158.	0.85	0.00
6/22/2020	Josh Sanford	Examination of OC email	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Opposing Counsel Communicat	2063	Duplicative of 2058		0.10	0.00
6/23/2020	Josh Sanford	Deposition of Eusebio Depo	\$500.00	3	\$1,500.00	Deposition Related	2079	Duplicative of 2085	90% Unsuccessful on depo substance, per summary judgment ruling Doc. 158.	0.30	0.00

## Exhibit 5 - Segovia Duplicative Time

Date Billed On	Billed By	Description: Redacted	Rate	Time Claimed	Value Claimed	Category	Entry #	Objection	Abandoned or Unsuccessful	Reduced Hours for Abandoned & Unsuccessful	Reasonable Hours
6/24/2020	Josh Sanford	Deposition of A. Hill	\$500.00	3.7	\$1,850.00	Deposition Related	2095	Duplicative of depo time in 2096	90% Unsuccessful on depo substance, per summary judgment ruling Doc. 158.	0.37	0.00
6/24/2020	Josh Sanford	Examination of email to OC	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Opposing Counsel Communicat	2094	Duplicative of 2058		0.10	0.00
6/26/2020	Sean Short	Receipt and review of email regarding read and sign for deposition of Robert McGarity.	\$255.00	0.1	\$25.50	Deposition Related	2107	Duplicative of 2105	90% Unsuccessful on depo substance, per summary judgment ruling Doc. 158.	0.01	0.00
7/1/2020	Sean Short	Editing and revision of damage calculations.	\$255.00	0.4	\$102.00	Damages	2122	Duplicative of 2126		0.40	0.00
7/1/2020	Josh Sanford	Examination of emails with OC	\$500.00	0.2	\$100.00	Opposing Counsel Communicat	2129	Duplicative of 2121		0.20	0.00
7/7/2020	Josh Sanford	Examination of OC email	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Opposing Counsel Communicat	2167	Duplicative of 2132		0.10	0.00
7/13/2020	Josh Sanford	Deposition of Y. Exposito (with local travel)	\$500.00	3.6	\$1,800.00	Deposition Related	2207	Duplicative of 2220	90% Unsuccessful on depo substance, per summary judgment ruling Doc. 158.	0.36	0.00
7/14/2020	Josh Sanford	Examination of IOM: depositions	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Opposing Counsel Communicat	2238	Duplicative of 2237		0.10	0.00
7/15/2020	Josh Sanford	Examination of OC emails	\$500.00	0.2	\$100.00	Opposing Counsel Communicat	2258	Duplicative of 2256		0.20	0.00
7/16/2020	Josh Sanford	Deposition of Mukes	\$500.00	1.8	\$900.00	Deposition Related	2274	Duplicative of 2280	90% Unsuccessful on depo substance, per summary judgment ruling Doc. 158.	0.18	0.00
7/16/2020	Josh Sanford	Receive, read and prepare response to email(s) from OC	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Opposing Counsel Communicat	2277	Duplicative of 2278		0.10	0.00
8/12/2020	Josh Sanford	Examination of email to OCs	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Opposing Counsel Communicat	2376	Duplicative of 2379		0.10	0.00
9/14/2020	Josh Sanford	Editing and revision of Pafford Errata	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Deposition Related	2412	Duplicative of 2418	90% Unsuccessful on depo substance, per summary judgment ruling Doc. 158.	0.01	0.00
10/27/2020	Josh Sanford	Examination of order	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Case Management	2514	Duplicative of 2333		0.10	0.00
11/24/2020	Josh Sanford	Examination of OC email	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Opposing Counsel Communicat	2555	Duplicative of 2560		0.10	0.00
1/18/2021	Sean Short	Preparation and drafting of notice of delayed exhibits filing.	\$255.00	0.2	\$51.00	Decertification	2666	Duplicative of 2682		0.20	0.00
1/18/2021	Josh Sanford	Editing and revision of response to decert motion	\$500.00	1.2	\$600.00	Decertification	2662	Duplicative of 2645, 2648, 2658		1.20	0.00
5/28/2021	Josh Sanford	Examination of order-decert	\$500.00	0.3	\$150.00	Decertification	2741	Duplicative of 2750		0.30	0.00
5/31/2021	Vanessa Kinney	Receipt and review of order on decertification	\$360.00	0.7	\$252.00	Decertification	2745	Duplicative of 2750		0.70	0.00
6/23/2021	Vanessa Kinney	Receipt and review of defendant subclassification plan for collective action; draft response notes and email Sean Short and Josh Sanford	\$360.00	0.4	\$144.00	Collective Management	2769	Duplicative of 2776		0.40	0.00
6/24/2021	Sean Short	Receipt and review of VK's edits to Plaintiffs' proposed subclasses.	\$255.00	0.2	\$51.00	Collective Management	2790	Duplicative of 2783		0.20	0.00
6/24/2021	Sean Short	Editing and revision of Plaintiffs' report on proposed subclasses.	\$255.00	1	\$255.00	Collective Management	2795	Duplicative of 2783		1.00	0.00
6/24/2021	Sean Short	Preparation and drafting of proposed subclasses.	\$255.00	1	\$255.00	Collective Management	2797	Duplicative of 2783		1.00	0.00
6/24/2021	Josh Sanford	Editing and revision of P's report	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Collective Management	2787	Duplicative of 2783		0.10	0.00
6/30/2021	Merideth Q. McEnti	Receipt and review of Court Notice: ORDER ADDRESSING VARIOUS MATTERS AND SETTING STATUS CONFERENCE	\$360.00	0.1	\$36.00	Collective Management	2825	Duplicative of 2822		0.10	0.00
6/30/2021	Josh Sanford	Examination of ORDER	\$500.00	0.2	\$100.00	Collective Management	2819	Duplicative of 2822		0.20	0.00
7/2/2021	Josh Sanford	Examination of email to OC	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Opposing Counsel Communicat	2832	Duplicative of 2836		0.10	0.00
7/9/2021	Josh Sanford	Court Appearance (including travel time and waiting)	\$500.00	0.3	\$150.00	Case Management	2853	Duplicative of 2855		0.30	0.00
7/12/2021	Josh Sanford	Examination of minute entry	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Case Management	2856	Duplicative of 2861		0.10	0.00
8/6/2021	Josh Sanford	Examination of order	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Case Management	2876	Duplicative of 2880		0.10	0.00
9/14/2021	Josh Sanford	Examination of text order	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Summary Judgments	2961	Duplicative of 2970	90% Unsuccessful on depo substance, per summary judgment ruling Doc. 158.	0.01	0.00

## Exhibit 5 - Segovia Duplicative Time

Date Billed On	Billed By	Description: Redacted	Rate	Time Claimed	Value Claimed	Category	Entry #	Objection	Abandoned or Unsuccessful	Reduced Hours for Abandoned & Unsuccessful	Reasonable Hours
9/30/2022	Josh Sanford	Examination of order	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Trial Preparation	3645	Duplicative of 3642		0.10	0.00
11/4/2022	Josh Sanford	Examination of Order	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Case Management	3689	Duplicative of 3690		0.10	0.00
11/10/2022	Josh Sanford	Examination of Chambers email	\$500.00	0.1	\$50.00	Court Communication	3700	Duplicative of 3703		0.10	0.00
		Court Appearance (including travel time and waiting) for MJSC									
1/9/2023	Josh Sanford		\$500.00	2.5	\$1,250.00	Settlement Related	3820	Duplicative of 3823		2.50	0.00
				<b>57.45</b>	<b>\$26,058.00</b>					<b>26.04</b>	<b>0.00</b>